

**Proceeding of the Project Appraisal Committee (PAC) meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> June 2025 to evaluate the financial bids for selection of agency for appointment of Statutory Auditor for the Financial Year 2024-25**

---

With reference to the Notice Inviting Tender (NIT) Reference No.: - 06/SHSB/Statutory Audit/2025-26 for appointment of Statutory Auditor for the Financial Year 2024-25 for the State Health Society, Bihar (SHSB) and District Health Societies (DHS(s)) in all the 38 districts, 09 Regional Program Management Units and all Medical College & Hospitals (MCHs) in the state of Bihar for audit of all programmes under National Health Mission(NHM), India Covid-19 Emergency Response and Health System Preparedness Package-Phase-I (ECRP-I), India Covid-19 Emergency Response and Health System Preparedness Package-Phase-II (ECRP-II), Pradhan Mantri- Ayushman Bharat Health Infrastructure Mission (PM-ABHIM), PM-ABHIM-PMU, 15<sup>th</sup> Finance Commission for Health Sector Grant (XV-FC) and non-NHM in the state, published in leading newspapers bearing PR. 02280 (B & C) 2025-26 and RFP & corrigendum uploaded on the website "<http://www.eproc2.bihar.gov.in>" and "statehealthsocietybihar.org", the as per recommendation of the technical committee, Financial bid opened in presence of Project Appraisal Committee (PAC) meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> June 2025 in the Conference Hall of the 'State Health Society, Bihar (SHSB), Swasthya Bhawan, Sheikhpura, Patna'.

2. The following members of the Project Appraisal Committee (PAC) were present in the PAC meeting:

(i)	Shri Suharsha Bhagat	Executive Director, State Health Society, Bihar	Chairman
(ii)	Dr. Ram Narayan Choudhary	Director- in- chief, Health Services, Bihar	Member
(iii)	Dr. Ashish Kumar	For, Regional Director, RHO, MOHFW, GOI, Patna	Member
(iv)	Shri Gautam Kumar	Internal Financial Advisor, Health Department, Bihar	Member
(v)	Shri Rajesh Kumar	Administrative Officer, State Health Society, Bihar	Member
(vi)	Dr. Tarique Ahmad	State representative, UNICEF, Bihar, Patna	Member
(vii)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar Verma	For RTL, WHO, Bihar	Member

3. The following Bidders were present during the Financial Bid Opening in presence of Project Appraisal Committee.

1. M/s Jagdish Chand & Co., Chartered Accountants.
2. M/s Jaiswal Brajesh & Co., Chartered Accountants.
3. M/s Komandoor & Co. LLP, Chartered Accountants
4. M/s K R A & Co., Chartered Accountants

4. Technical Bids were opened by online e-tendering method and eleven bids (via e-tendering) were received through the tender on e-Proc2.portal. The technical committee has evaluated the bids as per the eligibility criteria mentioned in the tender documents.



where three bids were rejected, 2 bids were disqualified and six bids were found technically qualified. Technical Committee recommended to open the financial bid for below mentioned Six technically qualified bidders.

Sl. No.	Name of Technically qualified Bidders
1	M/s Komandoor & Co. LLP, Chartered Accountants
2	M/s K R A & Co., Chartered Accountants.
3	M/s Raj Har Gopal & Co., Chartered Accountants.
4	M/s Jaiswal Brajesh & Co., Chartered Accountants.
5	M/s. S P A R K & Associates Chartered Accountants LLP.
6	M/s Jagdish Chand & Co., Chartered Accountants.

5. Financial Bids have been opened by Bid Opening Committee in the presence of Project Appraisal Committee through online e-tendering method. The Project Appraisal Committee opened the financial bids of the above mentioned technically qualified bidders. Their price quotes for the audit fees are as follows:

Sl. No.	Name of Technically qualified Bidders	Audit fees for the FY 2024-25*
1	M/s Komandoor & Co. LLP, Chartered Accountants	₹3,80,000/-
2	M/s K R A & Co., Chartered Accountants.	₹3,80,000/-
3	M/s Raj Har Gopal & Co., Chartered Accountants.	₹3,80,000/-
4	M/s Jaiswal Brajesh & Co., Chartered Accountants.	₹3,80,000/-
5	M/s. S P A R K & Associates Chartered Accountants LLP.	₹8,12,460/-
6	M/s Jagdish Chand & Co., Chartered Accountants.	₹4,48,400/-

\* GST (if applicable) will be extra.

6. Project Appraisal Committee (PAC) has found, two bidders namely **M/s Jaiswal Brajesh & Co.**, **M/s Raj Har Gopal & Co.** out of six, have submitted their financial bids in a format different from the prescribed format however, the contents are as per the prescribed format so, the committee has decided to consider financial bid of these two bidders also for evaluation for award of contract. Accordingly, financial bids of all the six technically qualified bidders have been evaluated as per the Least Cost Selection (LCS) method mentioned in Tender documents.
7. It was observed by the committee that four (4) out of six bidders have quoted an identical price of Rs.3,80,000/- which is the lowest price i.e. L-1 price quote among all the bids received. These four bidders are mentioned at Sl. No. 1 to 4 as listed in clause 5 above.
8. Clause 8.3 of section III of NIT stipulates "In case L1 price is quoted by two or more CA firms, the selection of auditor shall be done considering the following factors (priority-wise):-

*J. Ahmad*

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*



- i. Past experience in handling Government Contracts for Statutory Audit, and
- ii. Turnover of the firm: The bidder/CA Firm with highest average turnover for last three financial years (FY 2021-22, FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24)".

Weightage of both the above parameters have been considered for the selection of a CA firm as illustrated in the RFP. Total weightage have been computed for these four bidders as per the method mentioned in NIT (clause 8.3, Section -III), which is as under:-

**Computation of total weightage:-**

Sl. No.	Name of the Bidder	No. of Govt. Audit	Weightage on no. of Govt. Audit*	Average Turnover for last 3 Financial Years (in Rs)	Weightage on Turnover**	Total Weightage	Rank of Bidder
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
1	M/s Komandoor & Co. LLP	113	65.32	88110613.33	66.28	131.60	2
2	M/s Jaiswal Brajesh & Co	53	30.63	17170475.10	12.92	43.55	4
3	M/s Raj Har Gopal & Co.	67	38.73	54411781.00	40.93	79.66	3
2	M/s K R A & Co.	173	100.00	132936739.33	100.00	200.00	1

9. In the view of above, the Project Appraisal Committee has found that, Bidder **M/s K R A & Co., Chartered Accountants** has secured highest Score. Therefore, It is recommended by the Project Appraisal Committee (PAC) to select the bidder **M/s K R A & Co., Chartered Accountants** as Statutory Auditor for the Financial Year 2024-25 on their quoted audit fee of **3,80,000/-** (Three Lakh Eighty Thousand) plus GST (if applicable) for conducting the statutory Audit for the State Health Society, Bihar (SHSB) and District Health Societies (DHS(s)) in all the 38 districts, 09 Regional Program Management Units and all Medical College & Hospitals (MCHs) in the state of Bihar for audit of all programmes under National Health Mission(NHM), India Covid-19 Emergency Response and Health System Preparedness Package-Phase-I (ECRP-I), India Covid-19 Emergency Response and Health System Preparedness Package-Phase-II (ECRP-II), Pradhan Mantri- Ayushman Bharat Health Infrastructure Mission (PM-ABHIM), Fifteen 15<sup>th</sup> Commission for Health Sector Grant (XV-FC), NT-MHP, State schemes like MUKY, Corona Unmulan Kosh and non-NHM in the state as mentioned in clause -11 of section -IV of NIT.

10. It is also recommended by the Project appraisal committee (PAC) that in case, the shortlisted/Selected bidder denies/fails to honour the contract agreement /Letter of Intent (LOI), the SHSB shall be at the freedom to negotiate with the bidder, with the next highest Score L2, and L3, .... (in this order), and with their consent, may enter into an agreement with the SHSB, for conducting statutory audit.

J. Ahmad



*J. Ahmad*  
25/06/2025

(Dr. Tarique Ahmad)  
For, State representative,  
UNICEF, Bihar, Patna

*Rajesh K. Verma*  
25/06/2025

(Dr. Rajesh Kumar Verma)  
RTL, WHO, Bihar,

*31/07/2025*  
25/06/25

(Dr. Ashish Kumar)  
For, Regional Director, RHO,  
MOHFW, GOI, Bihar, Patna

*Gautam K.*  
25/06/25

(Shri Gautam Kumar)  
Internal Financial Advisor,  
Health Department, Bihar, Patna

*Rajesh K.*  
25/06/25

(Shri Rajesh Kumar)  
Administrative Officer,  
State Health Society Bihar

*Ram Narayan Choudhary*  
25/06/25

(Dr. Ram Narayan Choudhary)  
Director-in- chief,  
Health Services, Bihar

*Suharsha B.*  
25/06/25

(Shri Suharsha Bhagat)  
Executive Director,  
State Health Society, Bihar